

**REPORT**  
**OF THE EXTERNAL EXPERT COMMISSIONS ON THE EVALUATION OF**  
**THE EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME "OBSTETRICS AND GYNAECOLOGY,**  
**INCLUDING PEDIATRIC" OF CORPORATE FUND "UNIVERSITY**  
**MEDICAL CENTRE" FOR COMPLIANCE WITH THE ACCREDITATION**  
**STANDARDS FOR PROGRAMMES OF POSTGRADUATE EDUCATION**  
**(RESIDENCY SPECIALTY) MEDICAL ORGANIZATIONS OF EDUCATION**

**period of external expert evaluation: December 7-10, 2020**

**1. Composition of the External Expert Commission**

In accordance with ECAQA Order No. 21 dated November 16, 2020, an External Expert Commission was formed to conduct accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties of the Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" from December 7 to December 10, 2020 (CF "UMC") in the following composition:



**Chairman of the External Expert Commission**

MORENKO MARINA ALEKSEEVNA,  
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Head of the  
Department of Children's Diseases  
JSC "Astana Medical University"  
Chief freelance pediatric immunologist of the  
Public Health Department of Nur-Sultan, a  
member of the European Academy of  
Allergists and Clinical Immunologists, a  
Member of the European Respiratory Society



**Foreign expert**

IVANA OBORNÁ,  
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Assessor  
for the recognition of accreditation bodies of the  
World Federation of Medical Education  
(<https://wfme.org/about-wfme/people/ivana-oborna/>), expert of the National Bureau of  
Accreditation for Higher Education of the  
Czech Republic, Deputy Chairman of the  
Fulbright Czech- American government  
organization, Vice-Rector for International  
Relations at Palacký University, obstetrician-  
gynaecologist at the Faculty Clinic of Olomouc



**Foreign expert**

ZINCHENKO RENA ABULFAZOVNA,  
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor, Deputy  
Director for Scientific and Clinical Work of the  
Federal State Budgetary Scientific Institution  
"Medical Genetic Research Centre named after  
Academician N.P. Bochkova" (MGRC), Head  
of the Laboratory of Genetic Epidemiology,  
Scientific Secretary of the Dissertation Council  
D 001.016.01 for the defence of candidate and  
doctoral dissertations in the specialty  
"Genetics"(medical and biological sciences) on  
the basis of the Federal State Budgetary  
Scientific Institution " MGRC " .



**National academic expert**

KURMANOVA ALMAGUL  
MEDEUBAEVNA,  
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Professor of the  
Department of Clinical Specialties, RSE on  
REM KazNU named after Al-Farabi,  
Leading Researcher of JSC "Scientific Centre  
for Obstetrics, Genecology and Perinatology",  
Almaty



**National academic expert**

ESENKULOVA SAULE ASKEROVNA  
Doctor of Medical Sciences, Associate  
Professor of the Department  
NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University  
named after S.D. Asfendiyarov"  
Member of the Association of Oncologists of  
the Republic of Kazakhstan



**National academic expert**

RAMAZANOVA SHOLPAN  
KHAMZAEVNA,  
Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate  
Professor Department of General Medical  
Practice No. 2  
NJSC "Kazakh National Medical University  
named after S.D. Asfendiyarov " .



**National academic expert**

KALIEVA SHOLPAN SABATAEVNA,  
Candidate of Medical Sciences, Associate  
Professor, Head of the Department of Clinical  
Pharmacology and Evidence-Based Medicine  
NJSC "Medical University of Karaganda"  
Member of the professional association of  
clinical pharmacologists and pharmacists of the  
Republic of Kazakhstan  
Member of the International Pharmacoeconomic  
Society ISPOR  
Deputy Chairman of the Formulary Commission  
of the Healthcare Department of the Karaganda  
region



**National academic expert**

SADIEVA ZHANAR ZAMANKHANOVNA,  
anaesthesiologist-resuscitator, head of the  
postgraduate education department  
JSC "South Kazakhstan Medical Academy"



**National academic expert**

DZHAMANTAYEVA BOTAGOZ  
DAUKIMOVNA,  
Candidate of Medical Sciences. and about. Head  
of the Department of Neurosurgery and  
Neurology of JSC "Scientific Centre of  
Neurosurgery"



**National academic expert**

BEISEBAYEV ELДАР NURLANOVICH,  
PhD, Assistant at the Department of Oncology,  
Mammalogy and Radiology  
NEI "Kazakhstan-Russian Medical University"



### **ECAQA Observer**

**SARSENBAYEVA DARIYABANU  
BULATOVNA,**

head of the international department  
"Eurasian Centre for Accreditation  
and Quality Assurance in Higher  
Education and Health Care"

Tel.: +7 777 1471726, e-mail:

[info@ecaqa.org](mailto:info@ecaqa.org)

The work of the EEC was carried out in accordance with the Regulation on the EEC (Order of the Director General of ECAQA No. 4 dated February 13, 2017).

The EEC report contains an assessment of the educational programme of residency in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" CF "UMC" for compliance with Accreditation Standards programmes of postgraduate education (specialty residency) of medical educational institutions of ECAQA, recommendations of the EEC on the further improvement of educational activities of CF "UMC" in the field of postgraduate education.

## **2. General part of the final report of the EEC**

### **2.1 Presentation Corporate Foundation "University Medical Centre" and educational residency programme in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric".**

The corporate fund "University Medical Centre" (hereinafter - CF "UMC") was created in accordance with the decision of the Board of Trustees of the Autonomous Organization of Education "Nazarbayev University" (hereinafter - Nazarbayev University) dated September 20, 2015 No. 20 on the basis of subsidiaries of the joint stock company "National medical holding".

The purpose of the UMC CF is to provide safe, effective and high-quality medical care, the development, implementation and dissemination of modern technologies in the field of medical science, education and practice.

Today CF "UMC" unites four leading medical centres, including the National Scientific Centre for Motherhood and Childhood (hereinafter - NRCMCH), the National Centre for Children's Rehabilitation (hereinafter - the NCDR), the Republican Diagnostic Centre (hereinafter - the RDC) and a branch in Kyzylorda. Three centres of CF "UMC" (NRCMCH, RDC, NCRC) have passed the international accreditation of Joint Commission International, which is a guarantee of the safety of the services provided and confirmation of the provision of medical services in accordance with the level of international standards. IN 2019 year by the decree of the Government of the Republic of Kazakhstan, the National Centre of Oncology and Transplantology was removed from the CF "UMC" and transferred to the jurisdiction of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan. Also, by the end of this year, the National Scientific Cardiac Surgery Centre will be transferred to the structure of the UMC CF.

Activities as part of the integrated academic health care system of Nazarbayev University ensures the uniqueness of the educational services offered. As a part of the integrated academic health care system, Nazarbayev University, CF "UMC" attracts foreign specialists' "mentors" and organizes master classes with the involvement of international experts on the basis of its centres to create a competitive generation of medical personnel, develop and adapt modern protocols for diagnosis and treatment of diseases as well as improving the quality of medical care.

CF "UMC" pays special attention to the issue of compliance with the requirements of international quality and safety standards of medical care JCI, including through the use of methodologies for continuous quality improvement, advanced training of medical personnel in leading medical organizations of the world, the introduction of a patient-oriented system of medical care, in including on the basis of recommendations of mentors-partners from Switzerland in the field of hospital services.

In accordance with the UMC CF Charter, approved by the decision of the Governing Council of Nazarbayev University dated October 16, 2015 No. 16.10.15 (with amendments and additions approved by the decision of the Governing Council of Nazarbayev University dated February 6, 2018 No. 06.02.18), one of the main types of activity of CF "UMC" is educational.

The organizational, functional and staffing structures of the organization are built taking into account the mission, goals, objectives and policy in the field of quality assurance.

The organizational structure of CF "UMC" is developed on the basis of strategic directions, approved by the governing body CF "UMC", vertical subordination of the relevant structural divisions to the Deputy Chairmen of the Management Board, Medical and Executive Directors in supervised areas. The basis for building the organizational system of the centres of the CF "UMC" are the main processes-blocks: medical, strategic, nursing and service and economic.

The Department of Science and Education (hereinafter referred to as the Department) is a structural subdivision of the CF "UMC".

Training in residency at the CF "UMC" has been carried out since 2016. According to article 8 of the Law "On the status of Nazarbayev University", "Nazarbayev Intellectual Schools" and "Nazarbayev Fund" Nazarbayev University, Intellectual Schools, their organizations carry out educational activities without a license, without state certification.

Residency programmes are implemented in accordance with the Rules for organizing the educational process in the residency of the CF "UMC" approved by the decision of the Board of the CF "UMC" dated February 15, 2018 No. 3.

Residency programmes are implemented in 11 clinical specialties:

- 1) 6R111500 Neurology, incl. children's;
- 2) **6R114400 Obstetrics and gynecology, incl. pediatric;**
- 3) 6R112600 Anesthesiology and resuscitation, incl. pediatric;
- 4) 6R114300 Neonatology;
- 5) 6R111900 Radiation diagnostics;
- 6) 6R114200 Pediatric;
- 7) 6R113300 Pediatric surgery;
- 8) 6R115000 Pediatric Oncology and Hematology
- 9) 6R114500 Medical genetics;
- 10) 6R113600 Traumatology and Orthopedics, incl. pediatric;
- 11) 6R111000 Nephrology, incl. pediatric;

The total number of students enrolled in the residency programme of the UMC Medical Centre in 2019-2020 is 66 residents, including 17 people in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including children's". In 2019 and in 2020, 51 and 32 residents were graduated, respectively, including 12 and 13 in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including children's", respectively.

The total number of teachers involved in the educational process of residency and additional professional training is 206 people, MD - 27, Ph.D. - 60... Number of teaching staff under the residency programme "Obstetrics and gynecology", **including pediatric** - 20, of them 5 doctors and 9 candidates of sciences.

## **2.2 Information on previous accreditation**

Accreditation of the educational residency programme in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" CF "UMC" has not been held to date.

## **2.3 Analysis of the self-assessment report of the study programme of residency in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" CF UMC**

Interviews were held with 22 teachers (in three groups), residents (43) and employers (representatives of practical health care). In 2019 and 2020, the release was carried out 12 and 13 residents respectively in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric".

Interview with teachers in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" (Table 2), as providers of the residency programme, showed that there are both successes and problems in

the management of the educational programme, since the main developer of programmes and teaching and methodological documentation is the Department of Education and science, and teachers are more involved in the preparation of instrumentation. In order to verify the data of the standard, 5 external experts obtained an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and the implementation of supervision. The experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation.

During interviews with programme teachers "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" the experts asked the following questions:

- Do residents participate in scientific projects?
- How many hours are spent on research activities?
- What are the criteria for forming a catalogue of elective disciplines?
- Are residents able to fulfil the number of practical skills defined in the individual resident plan?
- Are teachers and residents involved in the development of the educational programme?
- How many residents study on a budget and on a paid basis?
- Are there differences in the training of residents who study for a fee and on a state grant?
- What is the reason for the decrease in the number of residents in the period 2018-2019?
- What forms of social support for residents are provided?

It was found that the residents who study under the programme "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric", are involved in research activities in conjunction with the School of Medicine of Nazarbayev University (NU) the form of participation in conferences, registration of publications.

Teachers and residents take part in the formation of the catalogue of elective disciplines at the beginning of the academic year. At the same time, it should be noted that in the development of the educational programme "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" in terms of practical skills, it is necessary to involve both teachers and residents. Teachers noted that residents are overfulfilling the number of practical skills defined in the individual resident plan. All residents study under a state grant, so there are no differences in the training of students on a paid basis and on a budget, in addition, there are no differences in access for NU residents who are trained at the National Research Center for Maternal and Child Health (NRCMCH). Reduction in the number of residents in 2018-2019 associated with a reduction in government orders for this specialty. fastenings residents at the Family Health Centre, at the workplace, residents are provided with personal protective equipment at the expense of the organization, catering at affordable prices for residents and employees of the centre. A resident can count on financial assistance on the basis of an application addressed to the head of the organization, the allocation of the necessary funds is considered by the budget or tariff commission.

The review of resources showed that the clinical base "Scientific Centre for Motherhood and Childhood", available for review at the time of the external visit, corresponds to the goals and objectives of the corresponding educational programmes in the specialties - obstetrics and gynaecology, pediatric, neonatology, anaesthesiology and resuscitation, etc., since has 450 beds, including the Department of Women's Health for 100 beds (obstetric and gynaecological admission department, department of female diseases, obstetric departments No. 1, 2, 3, obstetric-gynaecological operating unit). The centre provides specialized and highly specialized care in the field of obstetrics-gynaecology and in vitro fertilization, neonatology, pediatric, pediatric surgery. NRCMCH has a sufficient number of topical patients (more than 1,350 medical services are provided annually, about 15,000 inpatients are received, more than 3,000 deliveries), modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students, and employees, who simultaneously fulfil the roles of teachers and curators (mentors), provide quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

A simulation class with a total area of 62.0 m<sup>2</sup> operates on the basis of the NRCMCH. A simulation classroom is located in 2 rooms equipped with the necessary equipment, furniture, a stationary computer, and the Internet. The simulation class is designed for approximately 15-20 students. In the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" in the simulation classroom contains obstetric simulators, a resuscitation dummy (adult), a resuscitation dummy (infant), an automatic external defibrillator with a bag (AED), a mouth-to-mouth breathing mask on a manikin for adults (Pocket mask), a ventilation bag for infant mannequins, one-way mask valve, CPR meter (Cardiopulmonary Resuscitation Correctness Meter), simulator for laparoscopy, hysteroscopy by Karl Storz.

There is a computer class with Internet access and access to foreign databases of scientific and educational literature. The reading room at the NRCMCH is designed for 34 seats.

The experts examined the documentation on the educational programme "**Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric**" by the link <http://umc.org.kz/educational-methodical-documentation/>, which confirmed the compliance with the accreditation standards, including teacher documentation [http://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/PPS\\_list.pdf](http://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/PPS_list.pdf) and curators of residents [http://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/about\\_curators.pdf](http://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/about_curators.pdf) and at the request of EEC members.

Then a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC started to design the final report of the EEC.

A meeting of EEC members was held. EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. The experts individually completed the "Quality profile and criteria for external assessment of the educational residency programme in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the postgraduate education sector in general and the department implementing the accredited educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

EEC Chairman Morenko Marina Alekseevna held a final open vote on recommendations for UMC CF and a final vote on recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council. Then the chairman of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment in the framework of accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties.

### **3. Description of external expert evaluation**

External expert work on the evaluation of the educational programme residency in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" was organized in accordance with the Guidelines for conducting an external assessment of educational organizations and educational programmes of ECAQA (approved by order of the Director General of the NU "Eurasian Centre for Accreditation and Quality Assurance in Education and Healthcare" No. 5 dated February 17, 2017) and according to the programme and schedule approved on November 16 .2020 Director General of ECAQA Sarsenbaeva S.S. and agreed with Medical Director of the CF "University Medical Centre" B.E. Khairulin.

To obtain objective information on the expert assessment of the accredited educational programme, the EEC members used the following methods: interviews with management and administrative staff, interviews with residents, observation, study of the website, interviewing employees of various structural units, teachers, questioning teachers and residents, review of resources in the context of the implementation of accreditation standards, the study of regulatory and educational documents both before the visit to the university and during the visit.

The sequence of the visit during December 7-10, 2020 is detailed in the Visit Programme, which is located in the documentation of the accreditation centre and in the annex to this report.

Interviews were held with 22 teachers (in three groups), residents (43) and employers (representatives of practical health care).

Interviews with teachers, as providers of the residency programme, showed that there are both successes and problems in the management of the educational programme, since the main developer

of programmes and teaching and methodological documentation is the Department of Education and Science, and teachers are more involved in the preparation of control and measuring instruments. In order to verify the data of the standard, 5 external experts obtained an opinion on personnel policy and approaches to the development of pedagogical competence of teachers, motivation to work with residents, and the implementation of supervision. The experts found that teachers initiate research topics for residents, stimulate the need for additional training and independent work with literature and medical documentation.

In order to validate the performance of the self-assessment report data and obtain evidence of the quality of the programmes, interviews were conducted with 44 residents on the ZOOM platform. Experts asked questions about satisfaction with training at UMC CF, sufficient time to supervise patients, work in “Damumed” with medical documentation, satisfaction with teaching methods and qualifications of teachers, social and moral support for residents who need it, participation in “Journal Clubs”, accessibility resources of international databases of professional literature. In general, the residents are satisfied with the training, assessment methods, and purposefully entered this organization, since they believe that the CF "UMC" has good educational resources, image and international connections, at the same time, residents would like more independence in managing patients,

Residents showed their commitment to the organization of education, were active in answering questions from external experts, demonstrated their judgments on the organization of training, assessment of their skills, advisory support, opportunities to participate in research and development, funding, demonstrated their English language skills when answering questions from a foreign expert Ivana Oborn. The experts studied the documents of residents (portfolio, results of assessment of residents-checklists, results of a survey of residents).

Interviews with 12 employers on all the educational programmes of residency of the UMC CF announced for accreditation were conducted online and included such questions as: knowledge of the university mission, participation in the development of the mission and proposals in the strategic plan, participation in the advisory bodies of the “UMC” CF, Satisfaction with the basic knowledge and skills of residents, participation in the training of residents through mentoring, providing the department and residents with the necessary resources for practical training and the formation of clinical thinking, about the problems of interaction with departments and universities in general, employment of residency graduates, etc. Employers are part of Educational and methodological council.

A review of resources showed that the clinical base “National Research Centre for Motherhood and Childhood “Available for review at the time of the external visit, corresponds to the goals and objectives of the corresponding educational programmes in the specialties -"Pediatric", "Neonatology", " Nephrology, including pediatric", " Pediatric surgery ", etc., since it has 450 beds , a sufficient number of thematic patients, modern equipment and demonstrates accessibility to students, employees simultaneously fulfil the roles of teachers and curators (mentors), provide quality training in compliance with ethics and deontology. Before starting the corresponding discipline of the educational programme, the resident receives a syllabus from the teacher and knows what skills he must acquire and develop during the training.

The experts examined the documentation on the educational programme "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" at the link <http://umc.org.kz/educational-methodical-documentation/>, which confirmed the compliance with accreditation standards, including teacher documentation [http://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/PPS\\_list.pdf](http://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/PPS_list.pdf) and curators of residents [http://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/about\\_curators.pdf](http://umc.org.kz/wp-content/uploads/2019/11/about_curators.pdf) and at the request of EEC members.

Then a meeting of the EEC members was held on the results of the external evaluation. A final discussion of the results of external assessment, study of documents, results of interviews, interviews, questionnaires was held. The members of the EEC began to design the final report of the EEC.

A meeting of EEC members was held. EEC members made generalizations of the results of the external evaluation. The experts individually completed the "Quality profile and criteria for external evaluation of the educational residency programme in the specialty " Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" for compliance with the ECAQA Accreditation Standards". No comments were



made by the EEC members. Recommendations for improving the postgraduate education sector implementing the accredited educational programme were discussed. A draft report with recommendations was prepared.

The Chairman of the EEC Morenko Marina Alekseevna held a final open vote on the recommendations for the CF "UMC" and a final vote on the recommendations for the ECAQA Accreditation Council. Then the chairman of the EEC for the management and employees of the educational organization announced recommendations based on the results of an external assessment in the framework of accreditation of educational programmes for residency specialties.

### **Results of the survey.**

The ECAQA observer from December 7 to 10, 2020 conducted an online survey of residents and teachers of the accredited educational programme of the CF "UMC" on the resource <https://webanketa.com/>.

#### **Residents survey results:**

The total number of residents who answered - 89. Out of the total number of respondents, residents of the 2nd year of study prevailed (91%), residents of the 1st year of study were 9%, respectively. Will recommend to study in this educational organization to their acquaintances, friends, relatives - 66% fully agree, partially - 25%.

70% of those surveyed strongly agree and 22% partially agree that programme managers and teaching staff are aware of their learning problems. According to 76% of residents, programme managers and teachers constantly involve them in the work of advisory bodies, 8% answered that they do not, and 8% do not know anything about it. 66% of residents are completely satisfied and 22% are partially satisfied with the conditions and equipment of classrooms, classrooms of this educational organization, while 3% of residents are completely dissatisfied, 6% are partially dissatisfied, and 2% doubt the answer to this question. In the opinion of 61% (completely agreeing) and 8% (partially agreeing) of the respondents, this educational organization has created conditions for recreation and meals for residents (rest rooms, benches / gazebos on the territory, a canteen) in between classes, but 22% of students partially disagree with this statement. 82% of residents fully agree and 10% partially agree that office equipment is available to them in classrooms and practice bases. Teachers provide residents with methodological and didactic materials, additional literature to prepare for classes: 67% fully agree, partially 19%.

88% of respondents are fully satisfied, and 9% are partially satisfied with the access to participation of students in research work. 64% of students are completely satisfied with the library fund and resources, and 28% are partially satisfied. 76% of residents are fully satisfied with the teaching methods, and 16% are partially satisfied. There is enough time for practical training (supervision of patients, etc.): 87% fully agree, 10% partially. 81% of the respondents are fully satisfied with the training schedule, and 15% are partially satisfied. 87% of the respondents were completely satisfied with the methods of assessing their knowledge and skills, and partly - 10%. According to 65% of residents, teachers regularly use active and interactive teaching methods in the classroom, and 18% of students believe that sometimes. Among the respondents, 72% expressed the opinion that that teachers constantly provide feedback after the end of classes, 15% answered that sometimes. 82% are completely satisfied with the fact that they study in this educational organization, partially - 10%, disappointed - 6% of respondents, while 2% of residents did not give an exact answer.

89% of the respondents are sure that this educational organization allows them to improve or acquire the necessary knowledge and skills in the chosen specialty. 60% of residents rate the organization of clinical training excellent, 25% - good, 10% - satisfactory. The majority of residents (81%) fully agree that a teacher (mentor, curator) of this educational organization is an example for them as a professional doctor, a person, while 16% answered that not all teachers of this organization are such. 88% of the respondents are completely satisfied with the number of patients for supervision or assistance during operations. Most of the respondents (78%) answered that they are currently engaged in research work, and 10% plan to start.

#### **Results of the survey of teachers of residency programmes:**

The total number of teachers on the list is 79. The total number of respondents is 50, including those with up to 5 years of experience - 28%, up to 10 years - 22%, over 10 years - 50%. According to the profile of the specialty: therapeutic - 4%, pediatric - 36%, surgical - 12%, **obstetrics and gynecology - 34%**, other - 14%.

42% are completely satisfied with the organization of the educational process, partially - 50%. Fully agree that the university respects ethics and subordination in relations between colleagues, teachers, management, 74%, partially - 26%. 50% of respondents are completely satisfied with the organization of work and workplace, partially - 44%. 48% of respondents fully agree that there is an opportunity for career growth and development of the competence of teachers in the organization, 42% partially.

Fully agree that in this educational organization, teachers have the opportunity to engage in scientific work and publish the results of research, 44% of teachers, partially agree - 42%. Fully agree that they are satisfied with the salary, 16% of respondents, partially agree - 34%, no answer - 12%, more yes than no - 26%, more no than yes - 12%. 48% of respondents are fully satisfied with the work of the personnel department (HR), partially - 42%.

Among teachers, 30% studied at professional development courses (programmes) less than one year ago, 28% of teachers - during this year, and 36% - more than three years ago. The microclimate in the team of the department / department / department / department satisfies 66% of teachers, does not satisfy - 12%, quite satisfied - 10%. Slightly more than half of the respondents (54%) fully agree that they can be realized as professionals in this organization, and 44% agree in part. According to 44% of teachers, students of this educational organization have a high level of knowledge and practical skills after completing the training programme, while 44% partially agree with this statement. 30% of respondents believe that applications for the purchase of methodological and didactic materials, office equipment,

When asked whether the UMC CF supports the teacher in participating in international and national events, 18% did not answer, 14% did not contact the management about this, 20% find sponsors, 32% answered that the organization does not pay any expenses, and 12% noted that they are supported by the payment of travel, travel expenses, registration fees, 4% - by payment only of travel. The majority of respondents (82%) fully agree, and 14% partially agree that residents have free access to patients and clinic resources.

22% are aware of the implementation of social programmes to support teachers, 52% do not know, and 12% of respondents doubt their existence.

Fully agree that this survey will be useful for developing recommendations for improving the key areas of activity of this organization, 56% of respondents, partially agree with this, 24%, and find it difficult to answer 16%.

The results of the questionnaire are presented in the appendix and, in general, demonstrate the effective management of educational programmes, the positive aspects of training on residency programmes, at the same time, identify areas for improvement (social support programmes for teachers, the availability of leadership and administration for teachers and residents, pedagogical competencies and professional development of teachers) ...

### **Conclusion from the external evaluation:**

The members of the EEC carefully studied and evaluated the main indicators of the accredited educational programme. The information obtained by external experts during the study of the self-assessment report, the preparation of a written review with recommendations for improvement, the implementation of the activities of the visit programme to the UMC CF from 7 to 10.12.2020 is analysed. All information associated with the data report a self-assessment validation information for each criterion standards of accreditation and verification of indicators of the Annex to the report on self-assessment, which allowed to verify the authenticity CF "UMC" information and supporting documents for compliance with the accreditation Standards ECAQA.

In the report on the self-assessment of the educational residency programme in the specialty "Pediatric" CF "UMC" described his real educational practice in postgraduate education. Before visiting the organization by accessing google disk

([https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1FxOheU2F2\\_zbWaoYqbxjgmzvgM3rT8Oe?usp=sharing\\_eil&invite=CPCAYgN&ts=5fcf09db](https://drive.google.com/drive/folders/1FxOheU2F2_zbWaoYqbxjgmzvgM3rT8Oe?usp=sharing_eil&invite=CPCAYgN&ts=5fcf09db)), documents are also reviewed by experts in 33 external expert assessment, the members of the EEC studied the main documents (mission, strategic plan until 2023, teaching materials of disciplines, syllabuses, control and measuring instruments, checklists, portfolio of residents, individual plans of residents for the 2019-2020 academic year, publications of teachers, admission rules to residency, personnel policy, internal quality assurance system programme, resources for training were viewed directly at the clinical bases of departments (classrooms, office equipment available for residents to work with literature, patient documentation, educational and methodological literature), resources for residency on the website <http://umc.org.kz/?residency=post>, which made it possible to identify the compliance of the educational organization with the basic accreditation standards.

When conducting an external examination, the Rules for the training of medical personnel in residency were taken into account (order of the Minister of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated September 18, 2018 No. ҚР DSM-16), paragraph 13. It was established that the clinical bases of the Educational Residency Programme "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" are National Research Centre for Motherhood and Childhood, SPE on the REM " Multidisciplinary City Children's Hospital No. 2", SPE on the REM "City Centre of Phthisiopulmonology" of the Akimat of Nur-Sultan that provide training at all levels of health care (from primary care to highly specialized). The accredited educational programme "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" has 3 clinical bases, of which one was visited by experts (National Research Centre for Motherhood and Childhood). The volume of the study load and treatment and prophylactic work in specialties is determined by the individual work plan of the student of residency for one year and is monitored by monthly reports of the resident in an arbitrary form. The accounting of completed tasks is drawn up in the form of a portfolio according to the recommendations in the syllabus.

In connection with the new edition of order No. 647 On approval of state compulsory standards and standard professional training programmes in medical and pharmaceutical specialties dated July 31, 2015 (as amended by the order of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 02.21. No. KR DSM-12/2020 Chapter 2. Requirements for the content of residency educational programmes with a focus on learning outcomes), the educational programme has undergone changes and additions in relation to the development of the research competence of residents, which must participate in the work of the research team.

In this regard, the experts assessed the involvement of residents in research. There is no general provision or requirements for the implementation of scientific work at the university. At the same time, proactive R&D is being carried out, in which residents participate through writing reviews, collecting patient data, analysing the literature and patient examination results, preparing reports and presentations at conferences). Also, in accordance with Article 222 of the Residency of Clause 4 of the Code of the Republic of Kazakhstan "On public health and health care system" No. 360-VI ZRK dated July 7, 2020, external experts studied the activities and conducted conversations with mentors of residents and found that each resident was provided with a mentor.

The experts took into account the fact that the accredited educational programme for the current state educational standard is being implemented for 2 academic years, therefore, at this time there is no graduation of students, nevertheless, the entire educational, methodological, personnel and resource base has been assessed for compliance with accreditation standards. Through interviews with teachers and interviews with students, it was possible to determine their direct participation in the development (Study and Methodological Council), evaluation of educational programmes, decision-making on a number of key issues in the selection of clinical sites, topics of electives, participation in the appeal commissions for the admission and assessment of residents, development of the content of the individual plans of residents and the selection of mentors.

At the same time, this substantiated the need for inclusion in post-accreditation monitoring, along with the implementation of the EEC recommendations, an analysis of the implementation of the criteria of Standard 9, an annual report on the contingent of students.

Recommendations for improving activities in the implementation of the educational residency programme in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" for compliance with

the Accreditation Standards, developed by the EEC based on the results of the expert evaluation, were presented at a meeting with the management on December 10, 2020.

The programme of the 3-day visit (December 7-10, 2020) of the external expert assessment of the EEC was completed in full. On the part of the UMC CF team, participation of all persons indicated in the programme is ensured.

Thus, the external assessment and the visit of the EEC members made it possible to verify and validate the data of the self-assessment report of the residency programme in full in accordance with the Regulation on the External Expert Commission, the Guidelines for the external assessment of the medical organization ECAQA education.

For the work of the EEC, comfortable conditions were created, access to all necessary information and material resources of the accredited educational programme was organized. Experts note the high level of corporate culture and discipline of those responsible for the postgraduate education of CF UMC employees, employees of clinical bases, a high degree of openness of the team in providing information to members of the EEC.

#### **4. Analysis for compliance with accreditation standards based on the results of an external assessment of the educational residency programme in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" and an overview of the strengths for each standard.**

##### **Standard 1: MISSION AND OUTCOMES**

The mission of the UMC CF is developed taking into account the analysis of the current situation in the healthcare system of the Republic of Kazakhstan and the tasks of the UMC CF within the integrated academic health care system of Nazarbayev University in accordance with the goals and objectives of the strategic development plan of the UMC CF, namely, to provide high-quality medical care, achieve financial sustainability by implementing the model of integrated academic medical centre that includes education, research and clinical practice and generates scientific excellence and innovation to ensure excellence in the provision of patient-centred and family-centred health care. The educational programme in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" is implemented on the basis of the mission CF "UMC" and is aimed at improving the medical care provided by training of a highly qualified specialist obstetrician-gynaecologist.

During the study of the self-assessment report and the results of the external visit, information about the mission is available on the website [www.umc.org.kz](http://www.umc.org.kz). To implement the educational programme, CF "UMC" uses classrooms, lecture halls, equipment and software in the educational process.

##### **Strengths:**

1. Construction of training in residency, taking into account the integration of education-clinic-science in the context of the introduction of modern principles of training specialists for health care;
2. Special status of educational organization and cooperation with leading medical schools of the world (University of Pittsburgh);
3. Demand for educational programmes of residency and additional education among potential students;
4. A stable reputation among medical organizations and development prospects, taking into account modern requirements for healthcare professionals;
5. Brand awareness of CF "UMC" and its centres, the opportunity complex multidisciplinary medical services.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out 17 standards conform: completely - 14, significantly - 3, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 1: completed**

##### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) In developing and approving the mission and strategic plan for the development of the organization, involve the representatives of stakeholders more widely and document this process (1.4.1, 1.4.2).

- 2) The self-assessment report must indicate that the EP is aimed at training an obstetrician-gynaecologist (1.1.1).
- 3) The strategic directions on the website and in the self-assessment report must be identical (1.1.1).

## **Standard 2: EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME**

Residency educational programme in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" is aimed at mastering theoretical and practical skills in accordance with the established final learning outcomes in the context of the qualifications of graduates of PAE programmes. The final results of training in the residency of the CF "UMC" are determined in accordance with the State Educational Standard of Education 2015 and 2020. The educational programme is adapted to the credit model of education, contains a feedback system that allows you to determine the strengths and weaknesses in the organization and conduct educational activities aimed at practice-oriented training and the use of various teaching methods, including distance learning.

The duration of residency training in the specialty "Obstetrics and Gynaecology, including pediatric" is 2 years. The educational programme includes classroom work, clinical work under the guidance of clinical mentors and student independent work (SIW). The practical part of a resident's training is 90% of the main volume of training, of which 15% is for independent work of a resident. To regulate the implementation of postgraduate education, the Rules for the organization of the educational process and the Rules for admission to residency were developed. According to these Rules, a curator (supervising doctor), a clinical mentor is assigned to a resident. The 360 °degree analysis survey is conducted annually.

During the external visit, educational and methodological complexes of disciplines were studied: academic calendars, working curricula, individual curricula, a catalogue of elective disciplines, working curricula, syllabuses, control and measuring instruments and a portfolio of residents.

### **Strengths:**

1. A wide range of specialties of educational residency programmes and the demand for potential students;
2. Implementation of educational programmes at the appropriate JCI accredited clinical sites;
3. Developed clinical practice and bedside training for residents;
4. Application of a variety of teaching methods.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 31 standards conform: fully - 26, significantly - 4, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0.

### **Standard 2: completed**

### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) Provide educational and methodological documentation for educational programmes in the state language in accordance with the provisions of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 07/11/97 No. 151-I on the languages of the Republic of Kazakhstan (with amendments and additions as of 05/24/18).
- 2) Ensure the participation of all stakeholders in the development of the educational programme (residents, clinical mentors, employers, alumni, representatives of professional associations).
- 3) Bring the content of the programme, the description of the definitions of the mandatory component and the entire complex of the EMCD in accordance with SES 2020 (2.1.2, 2.4.2).
- 4) The list of practical skills should correspond to the current level of knowledge (2.3.4).
- 5) Provide information on the organization, coordination, management and assessment of the individual educational environment (clinical base) and the educational process (2.5.1)

## **Standard 3: ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES**

The assessment of the educational achievements of students is carried out on the basis of an assessment of the level of competencies developed by the teacher together with the science and education sectors of the CF "UMC" centres in various forms: control questions, tasks in a test form, a

list of practical skills, situational tasks, an assessment of the level of mastery by a resident trainee manipulation, tasks for laboratory and other work.

According to the current Rules, students are provided with a guidebook for the entire period of study, a syllabus for the discipline, which also describes principles and methods of assessing residents...

Monitoring, internal control of the quality of training and educational achievements of students is carried out through current, intermediate, final control by discipline and focused on learning outcomes. The academic achievements of the resident trainee are assessed on a 100-point scale corresponding to the internationally accepted alphabetic system with a digital equivalent on a 4-point scale, which is kept in mind by the science and education sector of the UMC centres. To assess knowledge, the following control and measuring tools are used: tests, oral questioning, situational tasks, practicing practical skills at the patient's bedside.

During the external visit, the documentation was examined reflecting the educational achievements of the resident - the portfolio of the resident trainee, the journal of attendance and progress, assessment forms (summative, formative), the results of the questionnaire, the report on the implementation of the IR schedule, publications.

#### **Strengths:**

1. Assessment of educational achievements of students is carried out using criteria, regulations and procedures developed in accordance with the goals and objectives for the implementation of the educational programme;

2. Skills assessment is carried out using summative assessment forms that promote integrated learning and involvement in clinical practice.

3. Compliance of the final competencies of the residency programme in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" of the CF "UMC" with the requirements of the State Educational Standard of the Ministry of Health of the Republic of Kazakhstan;

**Conclusions of the EEC on the criteria** Out of 11 standards conform: completely - 6, significantly - 5, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 3: completed**

#### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Provide for the regular analysis and assessment of the quality of the methods and assessment formats used for validity and reliability in relation to the established learning outcomes and document (3.1.4, 3.1.6);

2) Consider the possibility of optimizing the documentation of the assessment of students' knowledge (introduction of an electronic journal) and the organization of training for teachers to maintain this documentation.

3) Ensure the publication of materials for residents on the site (update links) (3.1.2).

4) The list of key competencies needs to be brought in line with SES 2020 (3.2.1)

#### **Standard 4: TRAINEES**

According to the self-assessment report, the admission of students to CF "UMC" is carried out annually according to the study of the needs of practical healthcare and from the capabilities of the clinical base. Persons who have mastered educational programmes of higher education are admitted to residency. The admission procedure, selection of applicants and admission to residency are carried out in accordance with the Rules for admission to residency. The National Centre for Independent Examination is involved in conducting entrance exams, the content of the exams is formed on the basis of standard curricula in the specialty of higher medical education. Local executive bodies are actively involved in providing grants for residency students. So, at 2017 year in the residency of CF "UMC" in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" at the expense of local executive bodies, 1 resident trainee was enrolled, in 2019 year - four resident trainee. Residency training process CF "UMC" includes the passage of introductory and internal briefings by resident trainees on rules for the handling of medicines, international goals for patient safety, etc.

CF "UMC" supports the expenses of resident trainees when referring to internships, conferences in Kazakhstan and abroad. So, CF "UMC" reimbursed the costs of participation in the international forum in the Republic of Kazakhstan in 2017, 2 residents, in 2018 - 5, in 2019 - 8

residents and international congress abroad – 3 residents. CF "UMC" has a sector of psychosocial support, where art therapy, music therapy and yoga classes are held.

Residents participate in regular meetings of magazine clubs, the Grand Round, topics for discussion on which are provided by the students themselves based on the questions of interest to them in the department, in the assessment 360 degrees...

In the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric," the annual percentage of employment averages 88%. 12% were graduates who enrolled in further studies in the magistracy.

**Strengths:**

1. Compliance with the standard rules for admitting residents, taking into account the internal requirements for training at the UMC CF;
2. Involvement of students in the work of consultative and advisory bodies to participate in decision-making regarding the educational programme;
3. Residents have the opportunity to see rare defects, various nosology, participate in training events with the involvement of leading foreign experts, participate in foreign internships on the basis of strategic partners.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 30 standards conform: completely - 27, significantly - 3, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

**Standard 4: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) Expand the possibilities of distance or other training formats to provide residents with additional training, including in certain difficult or unforeseen situations (4.5.4).
- 2) The link "Rules for admission to residency" must be active (4.1.3, 4.1.4)

**Standard 5: TRAINERS**

The purpose of the personnel policy of UMC CF is aimed at creating a Personnel selection policy designed to ensure maximum efficiency in the search, selection and hiring of employees necessary to achieve the strategic goals and solve the problems facing UMC CF.

For teachers working at clinical bases of medical organizations, a prerequisite is the availability of an academic degree or the highest qualification category. The selection of candidates is carried out by assessing their compliance with the profile of the vacant position. The number and composition of the teaching staff are planned based on the needs of the educational process, the normative teaching load per teacher and the contingent of students. The work of the curator is determined at the rate of 3 hours per week per resident, one curator leads no more than 3 resident interns at a time.

Training and advanced training of employees is carried out on the basis of the annual Plan for the development of qualifications and competencies of personnel. CF "UMC" implements academic mobility programmes for teachers and inviting mentors in accordance with the goals and needs of students and employees. In order to motivate teachers, curators, resident trainees, UMC CF annually awards UMC students and employees based on the results of educational and scientific activities. So, at the end of 2019, teachers of the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including the pediatric" d.m.s. Bapaeva G.B., d.m.s., Professor Murzabekova G.S., Ph.D. Imankulova B.Zh., doctor of the highest category E.V. Lushchaeva

CF "UMC" implements academic mobility and mentoring programmes. For 2018-2019, 11 master classes were held under the budget programme 024 "Target contribution to AEO" Nazarbayev University " with the involvement of international experts, including obstetrics and gynaecology.

During the external visit, it was established that in Within the framework of the "Technology Transfer" subprogram and strategic partnership with the University Pittsburgh Medical Centre, on the basis of the best foreign centres, the teaching staff has the opportunity to improve their qualifications both in their clinical specialty and in the methodology of medical education.

**Strengths:**

1. Highly qualified teaching staff from among professional clinicians;
2. Policy of selection and recruitment of teachers;
3. System of clinical mentoring of residents;
4. The programme for the development of pedagogical competencies and organizers of educational programmes, which provides an opportunity to improve the qualifications of teaching

staff in foreign scientific and clinical centres, as well as the opportunity to attract foreign mentors to the base of clinics of CF "UMC";

5. Treating residents as part of the clinical team, effectively teaching clinical skills from the "supervised" stage to self-implementation by the resident.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 7 standards conform: completely - 5, significantly - 2, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 5: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Expand training opportunities for employees (teachers and managers) involved in the educational process according to methodology and active teaching methods (5.2.4).

## **Standard 6: EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES**

CF "UMC" has a modern material and technical base for training students, which includes: study rooms, lecture halls, conference rooms, libraries, computer labs, information technology tools, a simulation class, clinical bases. In CF "UMC" training of resident trainees is carried out on the basis of 3 medical centres accredited by the international commission JCI.

All clinical bases are equipped with modern educational and medical diagnostic equipment and equipment, ensuring the conduct of the educational process at a high professional level. The library fund is 5813 units, there is direct access to the Republican Scientific and Technical Medical Library, JSC "National Centre for Scientific and Technical Information". The total area of the libraries of the CF "UMC" is 324.67 m<sup>2</sup>, which is 2.4 m<sup>2</sup> per student.

Every year, when planning and forming the annual budget for 006 deferred expenses, a request is sent to the departments of the centres of the UMC CF, the teachers involved in the training of resident trainees to provide for the purchase of a list of necessary training equipment, educational literature in the context of residency specialties. To obtain feedback from resident trainees, the Residency Programme Evaluation questionnaire was introduced.

The main clinical base of residency in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric" is the National Research Center for Maternal and Child Health, which is a large multidisciplinary hospital accredited by the JCI, in which the entire range of educational resources is concentrated, allowing for a full-fledged educational process. During the external visit, the NRCMCH visited the structural units of the centre: obstetric departments, obstetric and gynaecological operating unit, a simulation centre, including the company's laparoscopic simulation equipment. The presence of international JCI accreditation indicates the compliance of the clinical base, material and technical equipment with international standards.

### **Strengths:**

1. Modern clinical base for training residents and international cooperation with a strategic partner - the University of Pittsburgh School of Medicine;

2. Provision of the educational process with appropriate medical equipment and access to clinical resources of practice bases;

3. Support of educational programmes with appropriate IT technologies, library resources with access to international databases of professional literature;

4. Programme of international cooperation with foreign partners.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 21 standards conform: fully - 17, significantly - 4, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0

**Standard 6: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Improve the use of the digital technology system in the educational process (6.1.2).

2) Contribute to the further expansion of international cooperation in the framework of joint scientific research with the involvement of residents.

3) Provide training for residents and staff on the use of available information technology (6.3.3)



4) The educational and methodological council must prescribe a work plan, reporting documentation (6.6.1)

### **Standard 7: PROGRAMME EVALUATION**

To monitor the implementation of the educational programme and as problems arise in CF "UMC" the following documents were approved and updated:

- Rules for organizing the educational process in residency
- Rules for admission to residency
- Requirements for the content, design and protection of IR under the residency programme
- Regulation on the educational and methodological council.

The Department of Science and Education organizes, controls educational events, monitors the implementation of innovative educational technologies and promising forms of organizing the educational process, and also develops recommendations for improving the educational process, taking into account the identified achievements and comments.

Every year, at meetings of the UMC, annual reports of students are heard, the results of an annual midterm certification, based on the results of which conclusions are drawn on the formation of competencies of residents. Feedback and 360 Degree Analysis results are discussed at UMC meetings and decisions are made on further corrective actions. The survey involves resident trainees, teaching staff, curators, patients, supervising doctors. The analysis of the results of the "Assessment 360" questionnaire of residents, clinical mentors, residency teachers and supervising doctors is considered at a meeting of the Educational and Methodological Council CF "UMC", where the results of the survey are discussed, the parties for improvement are identified. At the end of the year, an award is held based on the results of educational activities based on the results of the assessment. Rewarding based on the results of educational activities is motivational and aimed at improving the level of interest of clinicians in training residents.

#### **Strengths:**

1. A system for monitoring the quality of educational programmes through external review at the planning and approval stage, assessment by the educational and methodological council, feedback from participants in educational relations and indicators of the demand for programme graduates;
2. Actively applied feedback from students and teachers;
3. Assessment by type 360°.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 15 standards conform: completely - 7, significantly - 8, partially - 0, do not correspond - 0.

**Standard 7: completed**

#### **Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

1) Improve the feedback system by regularly monitoring and analysing the data obtained, including special questions in the 360° survey, reflecting the specifics of specialties, and use the survey results to improve educational programmes.

2) The results of the assessment shall be documented and made available to all interested parties (7.1.6).

3) It is necessary to provide information on the results of monitoring the educational programme by interested parties (7.3.1, 7.3.2, 7.3.3, 7.4.1, 7.4.2), as well as monitoring of clinical sites according to the developed indicators.

### **Standard 8: GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION**

Management of the educational process is carried out by the Department of Science and Education of the CF "UMC". The results of academic activities, the effectiveness of modern forms of management of the educational process, the prospects for further improving management and improving the quality of education are considered and discussed in the final reports of the Chairman of the Board, heads of key structural units.

In order to effectively manage the educational process, there is an Educational and Methodological Council, which is the main consultative and advisory body on educational, methodological and organizational support of the educational process in the centre. In CF "UMC" the Rules of training in CF "UMC" are periodically revised and approved, in which the rights, duties and

responsibilities of students and the administration of CF "UMC", the procedure for organizing the educational process is regulated in detail.

CF "UMC" has developed documents defining the scope of responsibilities and authorities in relation to the educational programme of residency, provisions for each unit, defining the structure, management and accountability, goals, objectives and functions of structural divisions, as well as job descriptions for each position provided for by the staffing table ...

The official website of the CF "UMC" provides information on educational programmes of residency: information for applicants, class schedule, academic calendar, catalogue of elective disciplines, syllabuses, etc., which ensures the availability and transparency of the educational process. For prompt receipt of information to teachers and students, there is an internal corporate mail of CF "UMC", chat in WhatsApp, which includes all the heads of the groups.

Quality Management and Patient Safety Department CF "UMC" coordinates the internal quality assurance system based on internal audits in the centres, tracers in accordance with the international requirements of JCI.

The budget of the CF "UMC" is formed from several sources: the republican budget (state order for the training of postgraduate education personnel, advanced training of medical workers, the development of scientific research, transfers); local budget; provision of paid educational and other services.

During the external visit, presentations of the administration were heard and the documentation of the UMC was examined.

**Strengths:**

1. Transparency of educational programme management;
2. Awareness of the participants in the educational process through the placement of information on the educational programme on the website of the CF "UMC";
3. Financial and economic activity of CF "UMC" is aimed at ensuring financial stability;
4. Ensuring the efficient use of financial resources.

**EEC conclusions by criteria.** Out of 15 standards conform: fully - 11, significantly - 3, partially - 1, do not correspond - 0

**Standard 8: completed**

**Recommendations for improvement identified during the external visit:**

- 1) Develop a policy of academic integrity and ensure the use of an anti-plagiarism programme (8.3.3).
- 2) To improve the mechanisms of management and financing of the centre to increase the motivation of teachers who implement the educational process in the specialties of residency (8.3.2, 8.4.1).
- 3) The results of the management review to achieve improvement in the quality of education are not presented (8.4.3)

Thus, all 8 accreditation standards have been met, no inconsistencies in the fulfilment of the criteria of each of the basic accreditation standards in the process of analysing the self-assessment report and carrying out the examination as part of the tasks of the external peer review programme were found.

**5. Recommendations for improving educational residency in the specialty "Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric":**

1. In developing and approving the mission and strategic plan for the development of the organization, involve the representatives of stakeholders more widely and document this process (1.4.1, 1.4.2).

2. The strategic directions on the website and in the self-assessment report must be identical (1.1.1).
3. Provide educational and methodological documentation for educational programmes in the state language in accordance with the provisions of the Law of the Republic of Kazakhstan dated 07/11/97 No. 151-I on the languages of the Republic of Kazakhstan (with amendments and additions as of 05/24/18).
4. Ensure the participation of all stakeholders in the development of the educational programme (residents, clinical mentors, employers, alumni, representatives of professional associations).
5. The list of practical skills should correspond to the current level of knowledge (2.3.4).
6. Provide for the regular analysis and assessment of the quality of the methods and assessment formats used for validity and reliability in relation to the established learning outcomes and document (3.1.4, 3.1.6);
7. Consider the possibility of optimizing the documentation of the assessment of students' knowledge (introduction of an electronic journal) and the organization of training for teachers to maintain this documentation.
8. Expand the possibilities of distance learning to provide residents with additional training, including in certain difficult or unforeseen situations (4.5.4, 6.1.2, 6.3.3).
9. Contribute to the further expansion of international cooperation in the framework of joint scientific research with the involvement of residents.
10. Improve the feedback system by regularly monitoring and analysing the data obtained, including special questions in the 3600 survey, reflecting the specifics of specialties, and use the survey results to improve educational programmes. The results of the assessment shall be documented and made available to all interested parties (7.1.6),
11. Develop a policy of academic integrity and ensure the use of an anti-plagiarism programme (8.3.3).
12. To improve the mechanisms of management and financing of the centre to increase the motivation of teachers who implement the educational process in the specialties of residency (8.3.2, 8.4.1).

## **6. Recommendation to the ECAQA Accreditation Board**

The members of the EEC came to a unanimous decision to recommend to the Accreditation Council to accredit the educational program of the residency «Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric» of the CF UMC for a period of 5 years.

**Chairman**

Morenko Marina Alekseevna

**The foreign expert**

Ivan Osborne (Ivana Oborná)

**The foreign expert**

Zinchenko Rena Abolmasova

**Academic expert**

Kurmanova Almagul Medeubayeva

**Academic expert**

Yesenkulova Saule Askerovna

**Academic expert**

Ramazanova Sholpan Hamzaeva

**Academic expert**

Sholpan Kaliyeva Sabatina

**Academic expert**

Sadiev Zhanar Samarkhanova

**Academic expert**





Zhamantaeva Botagoz Daukenova

**Academic expert**

Beisebayev Eldar Nurlanovich

**The observer Of ECAQA**

Sarsenbayeva Deryabino Bulatovna

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
r   
\_\_\_\_\_  
r   
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
  
\_\_\_\_\_  
IA   
\_\_\_\_\_

**Quality profile and external evaluation criteria (summary) of  
educational programme in the specialty " Obstetrics and gynaecology, including pediatric"  
CF "UMC"**

Standard	Evaluation criteria  Number of standards = BS*/SU	Evaluation			
		Fully complies	Largely compliant	Partially compliant	Fully complies
1.	<b>MISSION AND OUTCOMES</b> 17 = 15/2	14	3	0	
2.	<b>EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMME</b> 31 = 30/1	26	4	1	
3.	<b>ASSESSMENT OF TRAINEES</b> 11 = 9/2	6	5	0	
4.	<b>TRAINEES</b> 30 = 29/1	27	3	0	
5.	<b>TRAINERS</b> 7 = 6/1	5	2	0	
6.	<b>EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES</b> 21 = 18/3	17	4	0	
7.	<b>PROGRAMME EVALUATION</b> 15 = 14/1	7	8	0	
8.	<b>GOVERNANCE AND ADMINISTRATION</b> 15 = 13/2	11	3	1	
	<b>Total: 147 = 90/57</b>	<b>113</b>	<b>32</b>	<b>2</b>	

\* BS - the basic standard must be fulfilled by each medical educational organization, and compliance must be demonstrated during an external assessment of the medical educational organization and science.

## List of documents requested by EEC members within the framework of accreditation

<b>No.</b>	<b>Names of documents</b>	<b>amount</b>	<b>Date approved</b>
–	Questionnaire forms "Assessment 360 <sup>0</sup> " in the context of specialties	11	UMC Protocol No. 6 dated November 22, 2016
–	Job descriptions of the Foundation's health workers	28	Different periods for each provider
–	Resident job description	1	10.10.2016 UMC protocol No. 5
–	Job descriptions of DNIO employees	2	03.03.2020 year
–	Catalog of elective disciplines	1	Protocol 10 dated 09/02/2020
–	Fund mission and development strategy	1	2019 year
–	Residency educational programmes	1	2016, 2018 and 2020
–	Agreements and memorandums: agreements with clinical bases, agreements with residents, Memorandums of cooperation	12	From 2016 to 2020
–	Research work of residents	7	05/30/2017 Protocol No. 5
–	Code of Conduct	1	30.12.2015 Protocol of the Management Board No. 3
–	Evaluation forms	11	2016-17
–	Regulations on Clinical Academic Departments	1	19.06.2020, No. 12
–	Regulation on the Department of Science and Education	1	29.10.2018, No. 26
–	Regulations of other departments	19	
–	Portfolio of residents, personal file of residents	3	
–	Rules for the organization of the educational process of residency of CF "UMC"	1	02/15/2018
–	Rules for the search, selection, recruitment and certification of workers in CF "UMC"	1	19.11.2015
–	Rules for the search, recruitment, selection and certification of employees of the Fund	1	November 19, 2015 as amended in 2016, 2018
–	Rules for admission to residency	1	2018, as amended in 2019
–	Orders		2016 - 2020
–	Working curricula for all residency specialties	11	2016 - 17, 2018, 2020
–	Working curricula	17	2017 - 2020
–	timetable	3	2016-2020
–	Syllables	18	2016-17, 2018, 2020

-	Resident Lecture Attendance Log	3	1.09-12.09.2020
-	Resident duty schedule	10	09.2020, 12.2020
-	Educational and methodical council	10	Protocols from 2016 to 2020
-	Materials of the educational and methodological council		For 2019, 2020
-	Staffing table	3	NRCMCH - 11/30/2020, RDC - 11/30/2020, AUP - December 2020
-	Operational plan for the implementation of the strategy	1	03/27/2020
-	Regulation on teaching staff	1	Protocol 9 dated 28.08.2019
-	Foundation Charter (as amended)	1	05/12/2020
-	Instruction checklist of internal training	2	
-	SES	3	2015 and 2020
-	Mission of CF "UMC"	1	2019
-	Regulations on the Journal Club	1	28.04.2018 No. 2
-	Handbook-guide for applicants and students in residency	1	2020
-	List of residents	1	
-	Residency budget for 2020	1	2020
-	Quality management programme of NRCMCH and RDC	1	
-	Employer Application Form	1	2020
-	Resident Privilege List	1	2020-2023
-	Scientific works of residents: Pediatric: Aidybaeva K.A. Nurmukhanova A.S.	2	Dec 2019 Feb 2020
-	PC Certificates in Clinical Pharmacology - Gurtskaya G.M., Zhetimkarimovna G.	1	2015, 2017
-	List of scientific publications of the teacher Gurchkoy G.M.	1	Feb 2016
-	Certificates for successful completion of the course-seminar "Methodology for the development of examination material" to assess the key competencies of students "	14	November 24, 2020 NTSNE
-	Certificates of participation of CF UMC employees (pediatric surgeons, radiologists, obstetrics and gynaecology) in international conferences	9	2019 India (1) 2019 Italy (5) 2019, Moscow (1) 2019 Minsk (2)
-	Certificates / Testimonials PC "Methodology for developing the image of results-oriented programmes" 54 hours	2	11/18/2019 CF "UMC"
-	Exam materials for all specialties	3	2017-2018
-	Interim certification results in all specialties		2017-2018
-	Sheets and tests for all specialties	1	2017-2018
-	Journal Club Protocol	36	For 2016-2018

	<b>Obstetrics and gynecology - 10 reports</b> Medical genetics - 2 reports Pediatric - 1 report Nephrology - 1 report		
-	Library attendance log	1	2019-2020
-	Information board in the simulation centre	1	